

UNDEF



The United Nations
Democracy Fund

**PROVISION FOR POST PROJECT EVALUATIONS FOR THE UNITED NATIONS
DEMOCRACY FUND
Contract NO.PD:C0110/10**

EVALUATION REPORT



**UDF- GUA-10-405 – Strengthening Democratic Participation of Maya Communities in
Rural Guatemala**

Date: 17 June 2015

Acknowledgments

The evaluation team would like to thank Brenda XOL and Ernesto TZI CHUB, as well as all the members of the Asociación Probienestar en Acción – Saaq Ach’ool Nimla Kaleb’aal (APROBA-SANK) team who devoted their time and energy to organizing this mission. Their good will and professionalism contributed to its success. The evaluators would also like to thank all local actors and beneficiaries who participated in this evaluation process and agreed to share their thoughts and experiences.

Disclaimer

The evaluators are solely responsible for the content of this publication, which in no case can be considered to reflect the views of UNDEF, Transtec, or any other institution and/or individual mentioned in the report.

Authors

This report was written by Luisa María AGUILAR and Lucia XILOJ. Landis MacKellar, Evaluation Team Leader provided methodological input. Aurélie FERREIRA, Evaluation Manager at Transtec, provided quality assurance and editorial input. Eric TOURRES is Project Director at Transtec.

Table of Contents

- I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 1**
- II. INTRODUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT..... 5**
 - (i) The project and evaluation objectives..... 5
 - (ii) Evaluation methodology..... 6
 - (iii) Development context 6
- III. PROJECT STRATEGY 9**
 - (i) Project approach and strategy..... 9
 - (ii) Logical framework 9
- IV. EVALUATION FINDINGS 11**
 - (i) Relevance..... 11
 - (ii) Effectiveness..... 12
 - (iii) Efficiency..... 14
 - (iv) Impact..... 16
 - (iv) Sustainability..... 17
 - (v) UNDEF value added 19
- V. CONCLUSIONS 20**
- VI. RECOMMENDATIONS 22**

- VII. ANNEXES 23**
 - ANNEX 1: EVALUATION QUESTIONS:..... 23**
 - ANNEX 2: DOCUMENTS REVIEWED 24**
 - ANNEX 3: PERSONS INTERVIEWED 25**
 - ANNEX 4 : ACRONYMS 28**

I. Executive Summary

(i) Project Data

This report presents the evaluation of the “*Strengthening Democratic Participation of Maya Communities in Rural Guatemala*” project, implemented by the Asociación Probienestar en Acción – Saaq Ach’ool Nimla Kaleb’aal (APROBA-SANK) in Alta Verapaz, Guatemala. The project ran from May 1, 2012 to July 31, 2014, which included a three month no cost extension. Within this timeframe and with a US\$175,000 grant, the project aimed at achieving the increased participation and recognition of traditional authorities and women of the Indigenous Communities of northern Alta Verapaz in decision-making processes and administration of justice.

The project sought to reach the following groups of beneficiaries which have historically lacked recognition in the decision-making spaces at the local and national level: (i) 300 leaders from the 33 indigenous communities recognized by the municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá in northern Alta Verapaz, and (ii) the Maya women’s groups belonging to the Association of Organized Q’eqchi’ (AQT) in Chisec.

(ii) Evaluation Findings

The project was highly **relevant** to the needs of Guatemala’s social and political contexts, which is characterized by weak legislative frameworks and a poor implementation capacity of the justice sector. The general aim was to promote the recognition of indigenous groups which failed to be clearly recognized and protected. In practice, the project consisted of setting conditions for inclusive urban and rural development council systems, encouraging indigenous peoples and women in particular, to voice their concerns and get involved in decision making processes. This approach filled a gap in the existing consultation mechanisms and conveyed the needs of communities to the authorities in charge of local development projects design. The project also addressed some of the Guatemala’s legal system gaps by supporting indigenous communities’ representatives and to use their traditional norms when confronted with justice operators. Targeting the participation of indigenous women in particular was consistent with the needs for emancipation and recognition among indigenous communities.

- Although the project was implemented in a very difficult context, marked by discrimination and extreme violence against women and young people, the project proved to be highly **effective**, as it executed all planned activities. The work to raise awareness and provide training contributed to the effective participation of indigenous women and indigenous community representatives in the Municipal Development Councils and other public planning and decision-making bodies in both Chisec and Raxruhá. Ancestral authorities are now represented in the 13 microregions of Chisec, and indigenous authorities are consulted in the 17 districts of Chisec municipal seat. Prior to the project, women’s representation was minimal (a single woman for all of the micro regions), without any possibility for active participation. Forging partnerships with other organizations working on gender promotion resulted in Q’eqchi Maya women’s effective representation in both urban and rural development council system (currently there are 13 women for 13 micro regions, so one woman per micro region). They are invited to the meetings and have the right to participate actively. Through the creation of Community Broadcasters School, 28 young adults (10 women and 18 men) were trained, 22 of whom are still actively participating; using the comprehensive curriculum guide produced by the project. The project expanded the

transmission capacity and coverage of Radio Comunitaria Tzuultaq'a which in turn enabled to reach a wider audience.

The project's **efficiency** was highly satisfactory. The transparent and results-oriented management style maximized the use of human and financial resources. SANK's previous experience in the region secured dynamic linking between the indigenous communities, social stakeholders, and municipalities targeted by the project. The technical teams and consultants, for most Q'echi Maya displayed professionalism and commitment, which contributed to the project's relevance and achievement of outcomes. In addition, the 3-month no cost extension made it possible to consolidate the newly created discussion spaces between ancestral and local authorities. Among other results, it gave birth to the Regional Council of the Q'eqchi' X-AJK People and upgraded the Radio Comunitaria Tzuultaq'a capacity.

The project had a high **impact**. Some of its achievements are more visible, while others, though no less important, need more time to develop. The project's most obvious impact lies in the official recognition of 20 indigenous communities out of 51 and in the effective empowerment of ancestral authorities' as conflicts managers among their communities. These structural changes also fostered the collaboration with local municipal authorities and relayed the concerns of indigenous communities through newly created channels, such as the Congress of Q'eqchi Authorities (Xojomil Aj Kamalbe). Given the vulnerability of women and general lack of interest in their situation, their inclusion was an important first step for their recognition as social and political actors though there is a lot that remains to be done to achieve their effective representation within decision-making bodies.

The evaluation team's view of the project's institutional, technical, and financial **sustainability** is very positive. SANK is recognized for being deeply rooted in the Municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá and committed to increasing the participation and recognition of indigenous traditional authorities and women in decision-making processes and justice administration while its relations with a range of international donors have cemented its financial sustainability.

The project promoted the inclusion of indigenous women in local policy-making processes. This was an unprecedented measure and certainly paved the way for further improvements to the conditions for women who are particularly vulnerable in the Guatemalan context. This constituted the project **value added** together with the community radio, which was the first to disseminate information about communities and collective rights in an indigenous language.

(iii) Conclusions

- ***The project helped mitigate the weaknesses of the national legislation.*** In order to counter the weaknesses of Guatemala's legal system, which does not fully recognize the rights of the country's indigenous peoples, the project improved the ability of indigenous communities' representatives to ensure local and national justice operators' respect of their traditional governance systems.

- ***The project was written in the continuity of SANK's intervention strategy,*** which focused on long-term processes, and subsequently emphasized the project's impact and sustainability.

- ***The project had a multidisciplinary team of experts.*** The majority of its members were local Q'eqchi Maya, which fostered its accuracy and legitimacy in the eye of beneficiaries and local counterparts.
- ***The project was responsive to the needs of the local context*** in terms of conflict resolution, territorial defense, and participation of indigenous peoples and women in decision-making bodies forgotten or weakly addressed by the Government.
- ***The project strengthened indigenous and ancestral authorities' capacities by setting organizational processes and participation systems for decision-making in various communities.*** These trainings laid solid foundations for enhanced cooperation with the urban and rural development council systems.
- ***The project supported the recognition of the existence and organizational status of indigenous authorities by the local government,*** which contributed to the exercise of their collective rights and defense of their territories. Local governmental authorities have recognized the unique form of social organization of indigenous people as an expression of self-determination and as their own way of viewing life ("*cosmovisión*"); as acknowledged in various international instruments recognized by Guatemala.
- ***The project promoted institutional spaces for women's participation in the urban and rural development council system and their presence among the ancestral authorities.*** This is a highly positive achievement, although the quality of women's participation and the inclusion of men called for improvement as detailed in the recommendation rubric below.
- ***The project benefited from SANK's partnerships with other civil society organizations and municipal entities.*** Experience and knowledge sharing supported the institutionalization processes and participation of women effectively.
- ***The project trained community broadcasters, who put the issue of the collective rights of indigenous peoples in the public eye.*** The programs voiced community interests and gave a status of community spokespersons to the broadcasters trained.

(iv) Recommendations

- ***Include and explain the rights approach when training the various stakeholders: women, indigenous and ancestral authorities, and members of the urban and rural development council systems.*** There is a need for greater awareness among citizens that they possess rights to exercise their citizenship. The rights approach should be employed to create a social and political environment favorable to the exercise and enforcement of those rights.
- ***Develop a relevant strategic vision to tackle the issue of violence against women.*** SANK should conduct an in-depth analysis of the causes of violence and their connection with women's status in society in order to identify the most important priorities and maximize the results of its interventions in this sector. Activities to train and raise awareness among adolescent males and men could be implemented as well in a context so fraught with violence against women.

- The project prioritized activities for **dealing with cases of violence against women** that had already occurred, reducing its chances to obtain a change in mentality. It is thus recommended to **prioritize a preventive approach**, providing young men and women with a space for activities and exchange around gender equity.
- **Train women for political advocacy**, offering them training and tools to maximize the quality of their participation in the various Development Councils operating at the National, Departmental, Municipal and community levels (COCODEs, COMUDEs, CODEDEs, and CONADUR¹).
- **Improve procedures for the monitoring and review or adjustment of the strategies implemented.** SANK should include effective mechanisms in its institutional strategy to monitor the impact of its interventions and the successes achieved. This recommendation fits with SANK's general intervention strategy, geared towards long-term effects.

¹ The national Development council system is sub-divided per administrative level and namely active at five different levels : the National (Consejo Nacional de Desarrollo Urbano y Rural – CONADUR); regional (Consejos Regionales de Desarrollo Urbano y Rural COREDUR) departamental (Consejos Departamentales de Desarrollo CODEDE); municipal (Consejos Municipales de Desarrollo – COMUDE); and community levels (Consejos Comunitarios de Desarrollo –COCODE)

II. Introduction and development context

(i) The project and evaluation objectives

The “*Strengthening Democratic Participation of Maya Communities in Rural Guatemala*” project was implemented by the Asociación Probienestar en Acción - Saaq Ach’ool Nimla Kaleb’aal (APROBA-SANK) from May 1, 2012 to July 31, 2014, which included a 3-month no cost extension. UNDEF provided a grant of US\$175,000, of which \$17,500 was retained for UNDEF monitoring and evaluation purposes. The aim of the project was to create “a more inclusive democracy in Guatemala by increasing the participation and recognition of indigenous women and traditional authorities of the Maya Communities in northern Alta Verapaz, Guatemala, in public policy decision-making processes led by local government and the administration of justice”.

Although Guatemala has a legal framework for indigenous communities to effectively participate as citizens and exercise their right to self-determination, the reality is that top-down centralized State planning and implementation of public policies that affect indigenous peoples are common. The project sought to address not only the flawed decentralization policies that currently disregard indigenous peoples’ right to participate, but also the lack of access by these groups to information about their rights and how policy- and decision-making occurs. The project was also geared to addressing the results of this participatory shortcoming – namely, the fact that indigenous peoples’ lands, territories, and way of life are in peril due to the violation of their political, civil, economic, and cultural rights by development programs, infrastructure projects, and public concessions.

The project strategy focused on capacity building, self-determination, political participation, and access to information. It was built around three specific components: (i) Increase effective participation of indigenous women and indigenous communities’ representatives at the Municipal Development Councils in Chisec and Raxruhá, and other public planning and decision-making processes. (ii) Obtain an increased recognition of ancestral authorities (Yuwa’ Ch’och) and indigenous justice systems by justice operators at the municipal level and by members of indigenous communities themselves. (iii) Increase the access to quality information to indigenous communities regarding democratic participation and traditional justice systems.

To achieve these outcomes, the project analyzed the importance of participation by traditional authorities and the role of women in decision- processes within the communities, the municipality, councils, etc. and prepared them for wider discussions and negotiations at the municipal level. It worked to heighten indigenous people’s appreciation of their own governance and organizational systems and of the traditional Maya justice system. The project also sought to lend visibility to the practices of indigenous communities through broadcasts of discussions with women leaders and traditional authorities over the radio station operated by SANK.

The beneficiary groups consisted of at least 300 leaders from the 33 indigenous communities² recognized by the Municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá in northern Alta Verapaz and the Maya women’s groups belonging to AQT (Association of Organized Q’eqchi) in Chisec.

² In the end, the Project worked with a total of 161 communities; however, only 51 communities enjoy the legal status of “indigenous community.” In addition to these 51 indigenous communities, 110 communities in Q’eqchi territory that are not officially registered as indigenous communities sporadically participated in meetings held by the project, for a total of 420 participants.

The evaluation of this project is part of the larger evaluation of UNDEF-funded projects from Rounds 2 to 7. Its purpose is to “contribute towards a better understanding of what constitutes a successful project which will in turn help UNDEF to develop future project strategies. Evaluations are also to assist stakeholders to determine whether projects have been implemented in accordance with the project document and whether anticipated project outputs have been achieved.”³

(ii) Evaluation methodology

The evaluation was conducted by an international expert and a national expert hired under the Transtec contract with UNDEF. The evaluation methodology is spelled out in the contract’s Operational Manual and is further detailed in the Launch Note. Pursuant to the terms of the contract, the project documents were sent to the evaluators in early November 2014 (see Annex 2). After reading and analyzing them, they prepared the Launch Note (UDF-GUA-10-405), describing the methodology and evaluation tools to be used during the evaluation mission to Guatemala (Guatemala City, Raxruhá, and Chisec) from January 26 to 30, 2015. The evaluators interviewed project staff and members of the Asociación Probienestar en Acción - Saaq Ach’ool Nimla Kaleb’aal (APROBA-SANK), indigenous authorities, and government representatives. The team traveled from Guatemala City to Chisec and Raxruhá to meet with project beneficiaries, political leaders, and local government officials.

Annex 3 contains the complete list of persons interviewed.

(iii) Development context

Guatemala is a multiethnic, multilingual, and multicultural country inhabited by four major groups: the Mayas, the Garífunas, the Xinkas, and the Ladinos, who together make up more than half the country’s population. According to unofficial data⁴ provided by the Population Reference Bureau (PRB), a non profit international organization, the country’s population reached 15.9 million in mid-2014.⁵ Studies conducted by the Academia de Lenguas Mayas (Mayan Language Academy) indicate that more than one-fifth of Guatemala’s population does not speak Spanish. With 25 languages spoken in the country, 30% of the people speak one of the 22 Mayan tongues, with four of these predominating: Kaqchikel, K’iche’, Q’eqchi, and Mam; Xinka and Garífuna are spoken by 0.12% and 0.03% of the population, respectively.⁶

The Political Constitution of the Republic provides only tepid recognition of Guatemala’s indigenous peoples, promoting respect for their unique forms of social organization. Like the Constitution, ILO Convention 169, incorporated into the Guatemalan legal system through ordinary channels, also contains this recognition, though it establishes greater rights for indigenous peoples, such as recognition of their legal systems, social organization, and the right to participate and decide, among other things, on education, health, and development projects that may affect them. The Agreement on the Identity and Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which is part of the 1996 Peace Accords, was the first political instrument in which

³ Operational manual for the UNDEF-funded project evaluations, page 6.

⁴ According to the last official census conducted in 2002 by the National Statistics Institute, the total population that year was 11,237,196.

⁵ Press release published January 22, 2015. For more information, see:

http://www.prensalibre.com/noticias/comunitario/Poblacion-sumara-22-millones-2030-Guatemala-Centroamerica_0_1289871003.html

⁶ Unfortunately, more accurate and reliable data on population numbers and ethnicity are not available, since Guatemala has not conducted a census since 2002. Therefore, because the country has not met the international standard of conducting a census every 10 years, with a population count every 5 years, the available information is false, due to its insufficiency, meaning that the country is navigating without a compass in this very important area.

the State of Guatemala recognized its history of discrimination and racism against the indigenous people and committed to respecting the collective rights of Guatemala's indigenous peoples.

These instruments are the legal foundations for indigenous peoples to exercise their rights as active citizens. However, to clarify and strengthen those rights, specific laws expressly recognizing them must be passed. Although several bills on indigenous peoples have been under review for more than 20 years, the last Congress only managed to advance in a first reading of the Indigenous Jurisdiction Act and the General Law on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples.

In 2013, an evaluation of compliance with the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples was conducted in Guatemala. The report yielded the following findings:⁷

a) The most serious problems that impede swift, thorough, and impartial justice in Guatemala are structural impunity, political clientelism and lack of respect and recognition of the indigenous legal system; b) Unequal access to justice systems mired with racism and discrimination.; c) Substantive improvements are still needed to guarantee swift and effective justice in full alignment with the principles of equality, nondiscrimination, and linguistic and cultural relevance; d) Access to justice is also constrained by the lack of procedures to inform and guide indigenous peoples about where to go and for what purpose. These shortcomings are mitigated in practice by social actors who serve as "intermediaries;" these consist basically of local authorities such as community mayors, members of the Community Development Councils (COCODEs), and organizations; e) Indigenous women are those least able to demand their rights and secure legal protection. Hearing complaints and lawsuits involving domestic violence and alimony are among the main activities of the official justice system; and f) Many indigenous women do not know their rights or the appropriate channels for demanding their protection.⁸



Amílcar Pop of Guatemala, member of the National Congress of the Republic's Committee on Indigenous Peoples, (International Forum on Pluralism in Justice, Cobán, Nov 2013)

The report also states that in order to guarantee recognition and respect for indigenous rights, changes must be made in Guatemala's justice system, transforming its structure, operations, and enforcement of the law, with full respect for the world vision, free determination, and autonomy of its indigenous peoples

The indigenous peoples of Guatemala promoted renewed respect for their indigenous authorities and called for their strengthening, exercising the right to be consulted on matters that can affect them, primarily to defend their lands and territory.

⁷ Meetings for evaluation of compliance with the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, in the area of Access to Justice and the Indigenous Legal System. Dialogues in the framework of the new "B'aqtun." 2012; Headed by the Expert on indigenous issues for the United Nations, Álvaro Pop; Organismo Naleb', Guatemala.

⁸ Between 2005 and August 2010, the Ministry of Public Affairs received 513 complaints of discrimination. OACNUDH. Guatemala has exhibited a general tendency toward burying and underestimating cases. United Nations, Human Rights Council. Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights on the activities of her office in Guatemala, 2010.

This has been the case in the Municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá in Alta Verapaz, where the population (largely Q'eqchi) has a history of conflicts over land ownership and recently around a construction project for hydroelectric power plants. It is in this context where the justice system lacks legitimacy; where the State fails to promote appropriate local development projects and to provide proper security for the population That APROBA SANK devised the "Strengthening Democratic Participation of Maya Communities in Rural Guatemala".

III. Project strategy

(i) Project approach and strategy

The project strategy is aligned with SANK's institutional strategy, promoting sustainable actions, and is consequently articulated around the organization's four intervention axis: capacity building, self-determination, political participation and access to information by Maya women's groups and leaders of the indigenous communities recognized by the Municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá in Alta Verapaz.

The project in particular seeks to answer the lack of public policies and mitigate the weaknesses of the country legal framework, which do not fully recognize the rights of indigenous peoples nor the country multiculturalism, legal pluralism or indigenous communities' own forms of social organization. It sought to mitigate these weaknesses and to improve the level of governance in areas affected by territorial conflicts.

The project strategy promoted a more inclusive democracy in Guatemala, through increased participation and recognition of traditional authorities and women from indigenous communities in northern Alta Verapaz in public policy-making and the administration of justice. It promoted change in social relations and power models both among indigenous communities and governmental authorities acting at the local level. An important component in SANK strategic approach was to work with the rights' recipients and at the same with the actors that guaranteed them. Targeting rights' recipients not only aimed at creating knowledge and awareness among indigenous communities but also provided keys on how to exercise and defend these collective rights, such as the right to the land, the administration of resources, and self-determination. In parallel, the project strategy supported self-organizing among indigenous communities, who had elected their authorities and obtained legal status in the municipalities of Raxruhá and Chisec. Advanced support was given to these communities so they could expand their cultural norms and apply their sanctions systems to judgement of individual cases. Such empowerment activities were expected to strengthen the organization and work of indigenous authorities in urban settings, especially their ability to resolve conflicts, which would in turn contribute to lower levels of violence.

In order to meet these objectives, the methodological approach offered to work through three type of actions: individual training, organisational strengthening and communication. Among others these three main lines included awareness-raising, information, and training activities, with meetings to discuss and analyze issues affecting indigenous communities. These meetings included an advocacy component to strenghten indigenous representatives' capacity to negotiate proposals at the municipal level.

A key component of the project strategy laid in the empowerment of Q'eqchi Maya women to participate in decision-making bodies – specifically, in the urban and rural development council system. It aimed at raising the status of women, who are not consulted and therefore have no opportunity to formulate proposals or express their opinion about decisions that affect them on a daily basis.

(ii) Logical framework

The table below presents the project's intervention logic: its activities, intended outcomes, objective, and development objective.

Activities	Intended outcomes	Project objective	Development objective
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 69 meetings in indigenous communities of Chisec and Raxruhá, co-organized by SANK and AQT; • 24 monthly second-level training sessions for 10 community groups, Chisec; • Identification of topics based on current community problems; • 299 ancestral authorities in the municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá participate in meetings to strengthen indigenous communities; • 18 meetings with Yuwa' Ch'och' representatives and 5 with Na' Ch'och' women ancestral authorities • Three events to raise awareness among the COCODEs of Raxruhá; • 46 PRECOMUDEs workshops to train COCODEs in Raxruhá; • Strengthening the participation of Yuwa' Ch'och' in COMUDE; • 10 meetings (Cobán and Guatemala City) with the Secretariat of Agrarian Affairs, the Ministry of Culture, and Fontierras to provide legal assistance to indigenous communities in Chisec and Raxruhá; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Regional Forum (2012); • An International Forum (2013); • Case follow-up, attended by ancestral authorities of the town center. • Coordination of the official justice bodies of the municipality; • Technical assistance and training for ancestral authorities; • Systematization of information on the 741 cases resolved (08. 2013 to 06.2014); • Printing and distribution of 1,200 copies of a study on legal pluralism; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training of 28 community broadcasters (10 women and 18 men) at the Q'eqchi School for Broadcasters; • Design and production of the Comprehensive Training Program (4 modules), plus acting techniques for theater; • Production, design, and recording of the 30 radio programs produced; 57 broadcasting hours; • Maintenance and improvement of the interface and broadening of coverage; introduction of new technologies. 	<p>(i) Increased effective participation of indigenous women and indigenous communities' representatives at the Municipal Development Councils in Chisec and Raxruhá, and other public planning and decision-making processes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase in indigenous women's participation in decision-making bodies; • Institutionalization of local bodies for representation; <p>(ii) Delivering an increased recognition of ancestral authorities (Yuwa' Ch'och) and indigenous justice systems by justice operators at the municipal level and by members of indigenous communities themselves.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ancestral authorities and community COCODEs increase their knowledge about central and municipal government planning programs and their participation in the Municipal Development Councils; • Local entities and authorities of the official State recognize and respect the ancestral justice system of the ancestral authorities of the Municipality of Chisec; <p>(iii) Increased access to and quality of information for indigenous communities regarding democratic participation and traditional justice systems.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improvement in the quality of access to information through community radio broadcasts; • 28 young adults trained as community broadcasters. • Community radio upgraded and improved 	<p>Creating a more inclusive democracy in Guatemala by increasing the participation and recognition of indigenous women and traditional authorities of the Maya Communities in northern Alta Verapaz, Guatemala, in public policy decision-making processes led by local government and the administration of justice.</p>	<p>Contribution to strengthening recognition and democratic participation in Q'eqchi Indigenous People in the municipalities of Chisec and Raxruhá in Northern Alta Verapaz, in Guatemala</p>

IV. Evaluation findings

(i) Relevance

The project operated in a post-conflict context presenting high needs for democracy, rule of law and dialogue enforcement. It was aligned with national law in favor of decentralization and in particular with three laws passed by the national congress in 2002: the General Decentralization Act, the amendment of the Municipal Code, and the Urban and Rural Development Council Act, the latter of which stipulates that the urban and rural development council system “is the principal means for the Maya, Garifuna, Xinka, and metis population to participate in public administration for democratic development planning, in keeping with the principles of the multiethnic, multicultural, and multilingual national unity of the Guatemalan nation.”⁹



School for Broadcasters. Participation in the creativity course, Chisec, August 2012

The project promoted greater democratic participation at all levels of the urban and rural development council system, namely: community, municipal, departmental, regional, and national. The objective was to convey community needs to the bodies that set the priorities for development projects. It also raised awareness among municipal authorities and local representatives of State institutions, which do not always consider the needs of these communities or offer opportunities for consultation so that they can provide input about decisions that affect their territory.

The project educational support was relevant to the needs of traditional authorities (Yuwa' Ch'och') who lack knowledge to design and manage their own development projects at the central and municipal level. It also gave them keys on how to lodge complaints with local and/or state authorities and how to guarantee their rights protection on matters of land property.

Some men are very jealous; they don't want to lose their women. When violence occurs, many of them think “the women went looking for it; they got what they deserved.” They're still incapable of understanding that we, women, can offer ideas for change.
Margarita Osorio, Representative of the Municipio of Chisec

The second type of action led by the project was focused on organizational support and sought to improve the ability of indigenous community representatives to defend and obtain recognition of their traditional norms from local and national justice operators. The project communication strategy and use of community radio in the Q'eqchi language leverage indigenous people's knowledge on their collective rights, especially on self-determination and respect for their own system of justice and gave them visibility in the public eye.

⁹ Decree 11-2002 of the Congress of the Republic of Guatemala

The choice of targeted groups was relevant in particular the decision to dedicate particular attention to indigenous women and to their participation in community affairs. Prior to the project, women’s participation was virtually nonexistent, with a quota of one woman only allowed to participate in these bodies. The project community meetings and discussions were designed to empower indigenous women potential leaders so that they could gain access to decision-making bodies and entities, serving as spokespersons for their respective communities. Given women’s high vulnerability and the gravity of the violence perpetrated against them, this project component responded to the beneficiaries’ needs and expectations. However, the mission believes that a more in-depth analysis of the context priority needs would have enabled the design of a more relevant strategy. In fact, the project approach could have worked on three other components, essential to gender promotion: (i) raise awareness among men to adhere to women’s rights respect; (ii) design of an age-differentiated strategy that gives priority to young populations more likely to be receptive to embracing new relational paradigms; (iii) encourage women to believe that they actually have rights. Indeed, to change the behavior of men and society as a whole, it is not enough to raise awareness among women. Alternative ways of working with men must also be found to build relations that are both complementary and equitable. Otherwise, there is a risk that empowering women will be considered a threat to male power, which often fuels domineering attitudes toward women.

(ii) Effectiveness

The project is assessed to have been very effective. Notwithstanding the problematic context of the intervention, it achieved most of the intended outcomes in an entirely satisfactory manner.

One of the project components was designed to strengthen the effective participation of indigenous women and indigenous community representatives in the Municipal Development Councils and other public planning and decision-making bodies in Chisec, which counts 13 microregions of ancestral authorities and Raxruhá. Indigenous communities in Chisec have achieved greater representation than in Raxruhá, where, as a newer municipality, it has taken more time to get participatory processes up and running.



Meeting of women’s group in the Lomas del Norte community, Chisec, December 2013

The majority of the women’s empowerment activities were carried out in collaboration with other organizations working in this area, among them the Municipal Office for Women (OMM) and the Asociación Qana’ Tzuultaq’a (AQT), an organization with a long track record in promoting the organization of women. In addition, the Technical Committee of the Commission on Women was created through a partnership among four civil society organizations. This synergistic approach made it possible to maximize the project’s achievements and impact. The strategy for improving indigenous women’s participation in decision-making bodies was supported by a series of meetings in indigenous communities in both Chisec and Raxruhá.

One of the most significant outcomes was to secure the participation and representation of Q’eqchi Maya women in decision-making bodies of the urban and rural development council

system, especially in the Municipal Development Council (COMUDE)¹⁰, where their participation increased. Pursuant to a Municipal Agreement, women representatives from the 13 microregions of the Municipality of Chisec were allowed to participate in the Council. Prior to the agreement, only one woman's representative was allowed to sit with 13 men representatives. Other achievements were the municipal mayor's approval of a "Manual for Establishing Community, Microregional, and Municipal Women's Assemblies" and the drafting of a joint municipal policy proposal entitled "Tools for Eradicating Violence against Women in Chisec, Alta Verapaz" by AQT and SANK.

Through these initiatives, the project called attention to indigenous women's right to participate in decision-making bodies and the contribution that they can make to the design of public policies. However, the results in this component were limited by a context marked by the high vulnerability of women and the almost complete lack of recognition and respect for them as citizens with rights. While very convinced and highly motivated, many of the women interviewed shared concerns about the lack of support from their husbands, the majority of whom took a dim view of their wife leaving the house to participate in community affairs. Moreover, the women who participated in decision-making bodies said that their proposals were rarely taken seriously. Added to this was the high presence of violence in both public and private spheres.

In this context, it would have been important for the project to tackle women's problems from a broader perspective. This would have required an in-depth analysis of their needs and problems at the community level to develop relevant intervention strategies based on the situation on the ground.

Another major achievement was the organization and work of urban indigenous authorities, who serve as a resource for residents of the 17 neighborhoods in the municipal seat of Chisec. Their presence has contributed to the resolution of different types of conflicts and a reduction in the widespread violence in this municipality. A total of 741 criminal cases were heard and ruled on by Q'eqchi ancestral authorities in the municipal communities' seat from September 2012 to June 2014.

The fact that the indigenous authorities emphasize their Q'eqchi Maya identity has engendered the trust of residents, the majority of whom are members of that ethnic group. Moreover, the State's failure to act and the corruption of the authorities tasked with security in the municipality are other factors that have caused indigenous authorities to hear and resolve more cases of conflict in the municipal seat.

That trust has also led organs of the justice system to hear cases in Chisec and to ask indigenous authorities to coordinate with them in conflicts resolution, in particular in Coban where they lack legitimacy in the eyes of the population.

One other strong component of the project was the organization of the Latin American Forum (November 2013), in which national ancestral authorities met with experts from other Latin American countries. The purpose of this event was to build communication and coordination bridges between indigenous ancestral authorities and State justice authorities so to promote legal pluralism and full exercise of indigenous peoples' collective rights.

¹⁰ The national Development council system is sub-divided per administrative level and namely active at five different levels : the National (Consejo Nacional de Desarrollo Urbano y Rural – CONADUR); regional (Consejos Regionales de Desarrollo Urbano y Rural COREDUR) departamental (Consejos Departamentales de Desarrollo CODEDE); municipal (Consejos Municipales de Desarrollo – COMUDE); and community levels (Consejos Comunitarios de Desarrollo –COCODE)

Finally, the project made a highly significant contribution through its creation of the School for Broadcasters, which trained 28 young people (10 women and 18 men), 22 of whom are still active. Selection of the beneficiaries was participatory and organized through the Yuwa' Ch'och'.

The curriculum guide developed by the project included comprehensive training in four complementary areas: (a) indigenous identity and regional context; (b) history and law; (c) technology; and (d) creativity.

In order to improve the participants' speech and language skills, the project organized a theater course that was not initially planned. The students developed radio content (a total of 57 broadcasting hours) on issues connected with political participation in government bodies and local community administration. As a result of this process, indigenous communities now have access to weekly radio programs in Q'eqchi language and dealing with matters of interest related to decision-making and the traditional justice system among their community.

While Radio Comunitaria Tzuultaq'a already existed, the project enabled it to expand its coverage and boost its transmission capacity with new technology, facilitating equipment maintenance and the installation of a repeat antenna.

(iii) Efficiency

Efficiency in the execution of activities and achievement of project outcomes was highly satisfactory. With competent human resources and reasonable financial means, the project supported organizational and participatory processes that fostered the exercise of citizenship.

Project coordination was the responsibility of the Director of SANK (20%), who coordinates all projects executed by the organization. This management model is grounded in SANK's

institutional policy, which calls for the involvement of all members of all teams in the implementation of all projects. The entire staff meets once a month to analyze and compare the progress of each project's activities. Monitoring is done collectively, consistent with SANK's strategy of ensuring its strategic lines of action are implemented in all projects. Field

The theater group grew out of the broadcasters' group and was an unanticipated project achievement. When we began the training program, we found the young people a little reticent; they were afraid to speak in public, they would shake... So we gave them acting classes to loosen them up.
Emma, Head of the APROBA SANK Communication Team

The important thing is for community radio to maintain a community focus; to transmit the message to the people.
Pascal Huwart, APROBA SANK

The issue of community radio is a lesson learned: it is informative; it is a mechanism for telling people about their rights and boosting their self-esteem..
José Guoz, Maya Programme, UNDP



Indigenous authorities of the town center of Chisec, May 2014

monitoring is the responsibility of technical assistants, who oversee execution of the activities and have the closest relations with the beneficiary groups. In contrast, however, SANK does not appear to conduct monitoring of a more qualitative nature to study the effects and changes produced by each intervention, which would enable to review progress, and, obviously, achieve better results or change the work methodology.

SANK's animators and facilitators were highly competent, professional, and committed. The administrative team, responsible for financial aspects, provided efficient and transparent management as per SANK's operations procedures. The project also worked with a team of temporary independent consultants, hired on an *ad hoc* basis for specific project activities. The presence of technical teams and facilitators in the intervention zone was appreciated by the beneficiary groups, who consider SANK a resource for guiding their initiatives and creating spaces for interaction, coordination, and learning among the beneficiary communities.

UNDEF approved a budget of US\$175,000, US\$17,500 of which was retained for monitoring and evaluation purposes. The budget execution rate was 101.1%, revealing good coherence with the funds initially requested. The administrative team explained that SANK had to cover the excess expenditure in some of the budget lines (meetings with authorities, Pre-COMUDEs workshops, training for women's organizations, etc.) with the budget of other projects – in particular, with funds from the Ibero-American Foundation and the "We Effect"¹¹ organization, and earlier, with funds from the UNDP Maya Programme. The largest budget line (US\$63,849.70, initially estimated at US\$51,925.00) was for training activities, one of the intervention's priority components. The initial budget provided US\$21,600.00 for "travel" expenses, US\$10,568.12 of which was spent. The balance was used to supplement the training budget.

As for the planned implementation schedule, the project obtained a 3-month extension (through July 2014) that involved no change in the total budget. Initially planned for 24 months, the intervention was therefore implemented over a 27-month period. The reasons for requesting the extension were basically qualitative in nature, since the project sought to promote progress in the processes begun. On the one hand, time was needed to upgrade the technology of Radio Comunitaria Tzuultaq'a (FM 88.1), which was key to the project. On the other hand, it gave SANK time to analyze cases and consolidate new spaces for discussion and interaction with the ancestral authorities, providing assistance to the regional assemblies that gave rise to the creation of the Regional Q'eqchi X-AJK People's Council, a political body that represents the Q'eqchi Maya. The extension was made possible by the surplus available in the "staffing" budget; surplus accumulated from the 3 months delay in project launching.

Strengthening group identity is necessary for exercising rights in the indigenous communities' own legal and political systems.
Amílcar Pop, Deputy, Congress of the Republic

SANK expressed general satisfaction with UNDEF's management procedures. However, it considered the contract negotiation period as too lengthy and also stressed the burden of having all communication and documents translated into English, which had limited use and value among the team. As Q'eqchi, English comes as a third working language, after Spanish.

¹¹ Funded by Swedish Cooperation

(iv) Impact

The project had very tangible and visible effects on the beneficiary populations. Some of those effects were highly significant and therefore more tangible; others laid the foundations for developing new paradigms and, while no less important, will require lengthier processes for their consolidation such as mentalities progress towards equal participation of women in local politics.

The project had a positive impact in terms of the organization and recognition of new indigenous communities, supporting the registration of 20 new communities, for a total of 51. The communities received training and were capable of electing their ancestral authorities. At the same time, in the urban area, the Indigenous Mayorality was created, consisting of representatives from the 17 districts of the municipality of Chisec.

One of the most important project impacts was the strengthening of indigenous peoples' organizational capacity, especially through greater ability to resolve conflicts and social problems in their communities. These conflicts are not registered in any manner and hard to track but it is known that since the indigenous authorities were set up in 2013, there has been an increased number of cases settled, an increasing sense of trust and a dialogue-oriented atmosphere. These organizational processes have also fostered collaboration between local municipal authorities and the indigenous authorities system.

Strengthening the organizational capacity of Guatemala's indigenous peoples also contributed to the creation of the Congress of Q'eqchi Authorities (Xojomil Aj Kamalbe), comprised of indigenous communities from 17 municipalities in Alta Verapaz. This body was established pursuant to the guidelines of ILO Convention 169 (recognized by Guatemala in 1997) and the Guatemala constitutional provision (1985) recognizing indigenous peoples' own form of social organization. Its purpose is to ensure that the State



Meeting of Chisic's Municipal Women's Committee with the Municipal Mayor, August 2012

recognizes and respects the decisions of the Q'eqchí people in terms of their social organization, legal system, and right to decide about matters involving their lands and territory. All this resulted in better relations within the communities. The indigenous authorities are now able to play an active role in defending rights and at the same time promoting links between communities and participating in conflict resolution.

The project's promotion of citizen participation processes was a real contribution to the strengthening of participatory bodies, promoting and securing the participation of women and indigenous peoples at the different levels of governance: National (CONADUR), Department (CODEDE) ; Municipal (COMUDE) and Community (COCODE). The indigenous authorities can now speak and vote in the COMUDEs, a major step forward in the recognition of indigenous groups as people with rights.

The Urban and Rural Development Council Act recognizes the multicultural nature of Guatemalan society and encourages citizen participation in municipal management through new forms of participation such as the social progress committee, open town council meetings, and public consultations. This act also led to the restructuring of the Municipal Development Councils and reactivation of the Community Councils, considered as the main body for the people's participation in public administration.

Participation in the urban and rural development council system requires a systematic process that includes analysis of the local and national context and tools that will enable the representatives to submit and follow up on their proposals.
Byron Rogelio Caal, COCODE facilitator

The project had a positive impact on women's participation in the COMUDES, COCODEs, and CODEDEs. Securing a permanent space for their representation in these public administration bodies was an unprecedented achievement, highly appreciated by both the SANK teams and the women themselves. While the quality of this representation still needs improvement, especially with respect to the collective identification of community needs and how to convey them, the impact of women's inclusion is undeniable. In the meetings held and interviews conducted during the mission, the women expressed their motivation and conviction about the importance of maintaining their presence in these bodies. They also talked about the problems they encountered, especially in obtaining their husband's permission, as well as the need for basic funding to cover expenses related to their representation (travel, cost of participating in meetings, etc.).

The women we have trained are being sought after by political parties to work in entities preparing for the local elections.
Ernesto TZI CHUB, Director, APROBA SANK; Project

Finally, it should be noted that the results obtained with these good practices sparked the interest of communities in other Q'eqchi municipalities bordering on Chisec and Raxruhá – including Ixcán Quiché and others in Alta Verapaz – in organizing, registering as indigenous communities, and gaining recognition for their local authorities.

On another level, the mobilization of the young indigenous people trained in public broadcasting was successful as they remain committed and enthusiastic about participating in community radio activities and at the same time have been named spokespersons in their communities. Besides, the equipment provided for Radio Comunitaria has enabled it to expand its coverage and broadcast information to a wider audience which should ensure continuity in the dissemination of education messages.

(iv) Sustainability

SANK began operations in 1999, obtaining legal recognition in 2002. Guaranteeing the sustainability of project processes is one of the components inherent to SANK's institutional strategic approach. The majority of SANK members are Q'eqchi Maya and therefore have an excellent knowledge of the context, enjoying the recognition and trust of the indigenous communities they work with, thus ensuring acceptance and to some extent adherence to project activities.

The interviewees met all considered SANK a resource that provides extremely valuable support and said that without its help, the beneficiary groups would not have achieved what they have. SANK, moreover, has many contacts from Chisec and Raxruhá in the region, which has contributed to its legitimacy and professional experience. This organization has

gained the respect not only of the beneficiary groups but the region’s social and political stakeholders as well which is a recurrent advantage to its intervention sustainability.

SANK’s partnerships with other organizations have also contributed to the sustainability of its activities. For example, the Mayan Bar and Notary Association of Guatemala has provided SANK with legal assistance for training indigenous and ancestral authorities and worked with local women’s organizations on women’s rights. After the project ended, they kept providing assistance to women, but also technical support to the



Traditional ceremony to open the activity to recognize the indigenous authorities of Chisec’s town center, August 2012

community radio and to indigenous authorities active in the cities and in micro –regions.

It was noted that many of the men and women leaders who benefited from the training have made efforts to convey the information to their own communities, producing a multiplier effect that has the potential to ensure the continuity of the project’s impact. This multiplier effect was supported by the continuous support provided by SANK to ensure communities’ ownership and follow-up of the initiatives.

The outlook for financial sustainability is equally positive. SANK has resources from other funding agencies to support the implementation of its institutional strategic priorities; these funds are administered by the teams in charge of land agriculture, women, and communications issues.



Participation of the public at the International Forum on Legal Pluralism, Cobán, November 2013

The Inter-American Foundation, a U.S. organization that co-financed several of the UNDEF project’s activities, and Swedish Cooperation’s “We Effect” organization are currently providing continuity for the processes and activities.

In addition, the political participation component of UNDP’s Maya Programme is supporting systematic political education initiatives, as well as the development of an indigenous peoples’ own development agenda and political advocacy plan in Chisec and Raxruhá. These initiatives are good indicators of sustainability for the project’s initiatives, and at the

same time reflect SANK's capacity to guarantee financial resources and provide continuity for its interventions.

(v) UNDEF value added

The project promoted the recognition of indigenous women in decision-making bodies and strengthened the community radio station, which has become an unprecedented tool for information dissemination about indigenous communities rights.

These processes lent visibility to the problems and constraints stemming from the absence of relevant public policies. Although its achievements will require long-term support, the project has achieved significant results, offering beneficiaries, men and women alike, tangible opportunities for participation and the collective development of democratic processes.

V. Conclusions

The evaluation team reached its conclusions and identified lessons learned through interviews and group meetings with the beneficiaries (both men and women), experts, and other actors involved in the project.

(i) The project helped mitigate the weaknesses of the national legislation. Guatemala's legal system does not fully recognize the rights of its indigenous peoples. Its Constitution does not recognize a Multicultural State, legal pluralism, or the unique social organization of indigenous communities. The project improved the ability of the representatives of indigenous communities to discuss and argue on behalf of their traditional form of governance with local and national justice operators. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance, impact and effectiveness.

(ii) The project fit within the strategic priorities of SANK. The majority of its members was local Q'eqchi Maya and therefore had an excellent knowledge of the context in which the intervention was being implemented, thus ensuring its relevance. The organization's strategy is centered on promoting long-term processes. To accomplish this, it identifies projects that will maximize the impact and sustainability of those processes. This conclusion follows from the findings on impact, sustainability and effectiveness.

(iii) The project promoted organizational processes and the coordination of systems for participation and decision-making in different communities. It secured the participation of legitimate community representatives in the work of the urban and rural development council system. It improved the organization of indigenous and ancestral community authorities. At the same time, it achieved coordination between these two systems of participation, clearly delimiting their authority and spheres of intervention. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance, impact, and effectiveness.

(iv) The project promoted institutional spaces for women's participation in the urban and rural development council system and their presence among the ancestral authorities. The Women's Committee is comprised of 13 members and 13 alternates from all the microregions of the Municipality of Chisec, who in turn, participate in the COMUDE. These are very positive results, although the quality of women's participation (their representativeness and advocacy capacity) must still be strengthened. This conclusion follows from findings on relevance and impact.

(v) The project benefited from SANK's partnerships with other civil society stakeholders and municipal entities. This dynamic prevented the duplication of efforts and achieved better results in its undertakings. It had a major impact on the institutionalization of women's participation. This conclusion follows from the findings on impact and effectiveness.

(vi) The project trained community broadcasters, who put the issue of the collective rights of indigenous peoples in the public eye. The participants received training in the identification of issues of community interest, technology, and creativity in their approach to the issues addressed. They also studied history. These broadcasters are now considered as spokespersons for their communities. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance and impact.

(vii) The project did not employ a strategic vision in its intervention with women. It did not conduct an in-depth analysis of the many causes of all forms of violence and the weakening of women's role in society. Such an exercise would have helped set work priorities for empowering women and raising their status. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance, impact and effectiveness.

(viii) The project did not sufficiently incorporate the gender approach. The awareness-raising and training activities did not target adolescent males and men, even though the local context is marked by high levels of violence against women. In order to change the behavior of men and society as a whole, work must be done with men to build complementary, equitable relations. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance and impact.

(ix) The project did not employ a preventive approach. To eradicate violence against women, the project prioritized treatment for the victims of violence. A preventive approach aimed at identifying the structural causes of this phenomenon and raising awareness among men and adolescent males to promote a change in mentality regarding women's status in society would have been very useful. This conclusion follows from the findings on relevance, impact and effectiveness.



First graduating class of the School for Community Broadcasters, Students, and Trainers, Chisec, August 2012

VI. Recommendations

The degree to which the intended outcomes were met was highly satisfactory. Thus, the evaluation team has confined itself to offering some suggestions that could serve to consolidate the organizational processes initiated and maximizing the impact of the action taken.

(i) Include and explain the rights approach in the training of the various stakeholders: women, indigenous and ancestral authorities, and members of the urban and rural development councils. The project centered its intervention on the right to participate in governance and should apply a right approach when training the various stakeholders: women, indigenous and ancestral authorities, and members of the urban and rural development council systems. There is a need for greater awareness among citizens that they possess rights to exercise their citizenship. The rights approach should be employed to create a social and political environment favorable to the exercise and enforcement of those rights. See conclusions ii, iii and ix.

(ii) Develop a relevant strategic vision to tackle the issue of violence against women. SANK should conduct an in-depth analysis of the causes of violence and their connection with women's status in society in order to identify the most important priorities and maximize the results of its interventions in this sector. Activities to train and raise awareness among adolescent males and men could be implemented as well in a context so fraught with violence against women. See conclusion iv and vii

(iii) The project prioritized activities for dealing with cases of violence against women that had already occurred, reducing its chances to obtain a change in mentality. ***It is thus recommended to prioritize a preventive approach, providing young men and women with a space for activities and exchange around gender equity.*** See conclusion iv.

(iv) Train women for political advocacy, offering them training and tools to maximize the quality of their participation in the various Development Councils operating at the National, Departmental, Municipal and community levels (COCODEs, COMUDEs, CODEDEs, and CONADUR). See conclusions iv and ix.

(v) Improve procedures for the monitoring and review or adjustment of the strategies implemented. SANK should include effective mechanisms in its institutional strategy to monitor the impact of its interventions and the successes achieved. An individual should be appointed with the capacity to continually monitor outcomes, progress, and changes in the beneficiary groups. The design of an age-differentiated strategy that gives priority to young populations who are probably more receptive to embracing the new relational paradigms should be a priority component of SANK's institutional strategy. See conclusion ii.

ANNEXES

Annex 1: Evaluation questions:

DAC criterion	Evaluation Question	Related sub-questions
Relevance	To what extent was the project, as designed and implemented, suited to context and needs at the beneficiary, local, and national levels?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Were the objectives of the project in line with the needs and priorities for democratic development, given the context? Should another project strategy have been preferred rather than the one implemented to better reflect those needs, priorities, and context? Why? Were risks appropriately identified by the projects? How appropriate are/were the strategies developed to deal with identified risks? Was the project overly risk-averse?
Effectiveness	To what extent was the project, as implemented, able to achieve objectives and goals?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent have the project's objectives been reached? To what extent was the project implemented as envisaged by the project document? If not, why not? Were the project activities adequate to make progress towards the project objectives? What has the project achieved? Where it failed to meet the outputs identified in the project document, why was this?
Efficiency	To what extent was there a reasonable relationship between resources expended and project impacts?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Was there a reasonable relationship between project inputs and project outputs? Did institutional arrangements promote cost-effectiveness and accountability? Was the budget designed, and then implemented, in a way that enabled the project to meet its objectives?
Impact	To what extent has the project put in place processes and procedures supporting the role of civil society in contributing to democratization, or to direct promotion of democracy?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent has/have the realization of the project objective(s) and project outcomes had an impact on the specific problem the project aimed to address? Have the targeted beneficiaries experienced tangible impacts? Which were positive; which were negative? To what extent has the project caused changes and effects, positive and negative, foreseen and unforeseen, on democratization? Is the project likely to have a catalytic effect? How? Why? Examples?
Sustainability	To what extent has the project, as designed and implemented, created what is likely to be a continuing impetus towards democratic development?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent has the project established processes and systems that are likely to support continued impact? Are the involved parties willing and able to continue the project activities on their own (where applicable)?
UNDEF value added	To what extent was UNDEF able to take advantage of its unique position and comparative advantage to achieve results that could not have been achieved had support come from other donors?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> What was UNDEF able to accomplish, through the project, that could not as well have been achieved by alternative projects, other donors, or other stakeholders (Government, NGOs, etc.). Did project design and implementing modalities exploit UNDEF's comparative advantage in the form of an explicit mandate to focus on democratization issues?

Annex 2: Documents Reviewed

Project documents:

- (i) PO Note - UNDEF;
- (ii) Initial Project Document;
- (iii) UNDEF, extension request, 02.2014;
- (iv) Mid-term and Final narrative reports submitted by Asociación Probienestar en Acción - Saaq Ach'ool Nimla Kaleb'aal (APROBA-SANK);
- (v) Milestone Report 2 (27/04/2013) by José E. Guoz Esquit (External Consultant);
- (vi) Milestone Report 3 (28 & 29/11/2013) by Ernesto Tzi Chub (Asociación Probienestar en Acción - Saaq Ach'ool Nimla Kaleb'aal (APROBA-SANK));
- (vii) FFU Report.

Materials produced during project execution:

- (i) Study on Legal Pluralism in Chisec;
- (ii) Memoria del intercambio nacional de Autoridades Ancestrales y del Foro Internacional sobre los avances en la construcción del pluralismo jurídico en América latina, November 2013;
- (iii) Guide to Realize Community, Sub regional and Municipal Assemblies of Women;
- (iv) Cronograma de programas radiales;
- (v) Reconstitución de las Autoridades Ancestrales en el norte de Alta Verapaz. Avances y retos sobre la pluralidad jurídica en la democracia guatemalteca, APROBA-SANK Guatemala, 2014;
- (vi) Autoridades Indígenas, Chisec, Monitoreo Justicia;
- (vii) Pensum, Escuela para locutores; Documentación para locutores;

Other documents:

- (i) Agriculturas indígenas y campesinas, identidad Q'eqchi y construcción nacional: Retomando el camino de la diversificación; APROBA-SANK- Guatemala, 2014;
- (ii) Informe de Encuentros para la evaluación de la Declaración de las Naciones Unidas sobre los Derechos de los Pueblos Indígenas, en el tema de Acceso a la Justicia y Sistema Jurídico Indígena; Diálogos en el marco del nuevo B'aqtun. 2012; Encabezado por el Experto para las cuestiones indígenas ante la ONU, Álvaro Pop; Organismo Naleb', Guatemala.

Annex 3: Persons Interviewed

January 25, 2015 ¹²	
<i>Arrival, international consultant</i>	
Evaluation Team meeting	
Luisa María Aguilar	International Consultant
Lucia Xiloj	National Consultant
January 26, 2015	
<i>Travel of the evaluation team from Guatemala City to Chisec and Raxruhá</i>	
Gumerciendo Reyes	Municipal Mayor of Raxruhá
Marina Hernández	Member of the Raxruhá Municipal Council
<i>Meeting with APROBA SANK Board of Directors and Technical Team</i>	
Carmela Xol	Accountant, APROBA SANK
Erwin Molina	Secretary, APROBA SANK Board of Directors
Sebastián Pop	Technician, APROBA SANK Field Team
Rogelio Icó	Chair, APROBA SANK Board of Directors
Ernesto Tzi Chub	APROBA SANK Project Coordinator and Technical Assistant,
Pascal Huwart	Technical Assistant, AVSF
Brenda Xol	APROBA SANK Project Management Assistant
Chahim Huet	APROBA SANK Coordinator
Edwin García	APROBA SANK Administrator,
Victor Cu	Technician, APROBA SANK Field Team
Juan Ixim Bol	APROBA SANK Agricultural Technician
Teodoro Maaz	Technical Coordinator, APROBA SANK Field Team and Indigenous Communities
Alvaro Chon	Technician, APROBA SANK Field Team
Elubia Mucu	Technical Coordinator, APROBA SANK Women's Team
Alicia Tzi	Technician, APROBA SANK Women's Team
Emilia Pana	Technician, APROBA SANK Women's Team
Domigno Tzib	APROBA SANK Agricultural Technician
Emma Cucul	Radio technician, APROBA SANK Communication Team
Carmelina Quixán	APROBA SANK Administrative Assistant
Luisa María Aguilar	International Consultant
Lucia Xiloj	National Consultant
January 27, 2015	
Ramón Che	
José Guadalupe Choc Caal	
Raymundo Chub Coc	
Vicente Rax	

¹² Due to flight delays caused by bad weather, the international expert traveled on January 24 and 25. Travel to Chisec had to be postponed until Monday, January 26.

Diego Caal	Central Authorities, Indigenous Mayoralty, Chisec Indigenous Mayoralty, Chisec
Manuel Cutul	
Jorge Quib Can	
Miguel Coc	
Brenda Xol	Assistant to APROBA SANK Project Manager
Juan Ixim	APROBA SANK Agricultural Technician
Teodoro Maaz	Technical Coordinator, APROBA SANK Field Team and Indigenous Communities
Gerardo Ché	Community Authorities (Yuwa' Ch'och', Na' Ch'och')
Vicenta Tzi	
Emilio Saquil Cuz	
Juana Guama Maquin	
Santiago Chaah	
Andres Mac Quib	
Sebastiana Mo Coc	COCODEs Members and Ancestral Authorities
José Chub	
Juan Caal	
Juana Caz	
María Pan Caal	Representative, Municipal Office for Women (OMM), Office of the Women's Committee
Mayra Caal Morán	
<i>Visit to the Community of Esperancito del Río, in Chisec</i>	
Elubia Mucu	Technical assistant, Women's Team, APROBA SANK
Victor Cu	Technician, APROBA SANK field team
Brenda Xol	Assistant to the Project Manager, APROBA SANK
January 28, 2015	
Lucia Ja	Representatives of AQT, Directors of Asociación Qana' Tzuultaq'a AQT
María Santo Chub	
Carmelina Tiul	
Mercedes Cho	
Angelina Tial	
Gloria Inés Cho	
Angelina Chen	Director of Community Radio
Manuel Pop	APROBA SANK Communication and Theater Team
Emma Cucul	Technical Assistant, AVSF
Pascal Huwart	APROBA SANK Administrator
Edwin García	APROBA SANK Administrative Assistant
Carmelina Quixán	APROBA SANK Accountant
Carmela Xol	Municipal and departmental women's representative (COMUDE)
Margarita Osorio	Women project beneficiaries
Sofía Ac	
Irma Macz	
Zoila Hue	
Emilia Pana	
Ana Rosa Xol Caal	
Juana Chen	
Closing meeting	

Carmela Xol	Director, APROBA SANK
Erwin Molina	Secretary to the APROBA SANK Board of Directors
Sebastián Pop	Technician, APROBA SANK field team
Rogelio Icó	Chair, APROBA SANK Board of Directors
Ernesto Tzi Chub	Director, APROBA SANK, Project Coordinator and Technical Assistant
Pascal Huwart	Technical Assistant, AVSF
Brenda Xol	Assistant to the APROBA SANK Project Manager
Luisa María Aguilar	International Consultant
Lucia Xiloj	National Consultant
January 29, 2015	
<i>Travel from Chisec to Guatemala City</i>	
David García	Consultant that systematized project information for indigenous communities and the project
Amílcar Pop Ac	Attorney and Deputy of the Congress of the Republic
January 30, 2015	
José Guoz	Mid-term Evaluator, UNDP Representative, Guatemala Office
Edgar de León	Representative, Maya Bar and Notary Association of Guatemala (AANMG)
Bayron Rogelio Caal	COMUDEs facilitator in Raxruhá, Guatemala City

Annex 4 : Acronyms

AANMG	Asociación de Abogados y Notarios Mayas de Guatemala
APROBA SANK	Asociación Probienestar en Acción – Saaq Ach’ool Nimla Kaleb’aal
AQT	Asociación Qana’ Tzuultaq’a
CDC	Community Development Council
COCODE	Consejo Comunitario de Desarrollo
COMUDE	Consejo Municipal de Desarrollo
CODEDES	Consejo Departamental de Desarrollo
CONADUR	Consejo Nacional de Desarrollo Urbano y Rural
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DDC	Departmental Development Council
EU	European Union
MDC	Municipal Development Council
NGO	Nongovernmental organization
OMM	Oficina Municipal de la Mujer
SANK	See APROBA SANK
UNDEF	The United Nations Democracy Fund
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme